Grading Rubric for Response Papers (15 points possible)

[1]   Writing quality (4 points possible)

excellent writing skills: paragraphs have points; sentences well constructed; argument is clear from beginning to end = 4 points

very good writing: most paragraphs have points; most sentences well constructed; but occasional lapses = 3 points

passable writing skills: lapses are more numerous than simply "occasional" = 2 points

barely passable writing: paragraphs have one or more or no point, but occasionally are clear; sentences are sometimes well constructed but often not; argument is difficult if impossible to discern = 1 point

not passable writing; spelling errors; incomplete sentences; unclear points; no argument = 0 points

[2]   Summary of article (3 points possible)

Complete summary: question of article clearly described; data set or approach included; author's answer clearly stated = 3 points

Incomplete summary: not all of question, data set or approach, and answer clearly included = 1-2 points

No summary = 0 points

[3] Method of critiquing argument (8 points possible)

a)   Identifying assumptions & replicating argument (3 point possible)

Identifies key assumption & replicates argument of paper = 3 points

Identifies key assumption but no replication; or, replicates, but without identifying assumptions = 1-2 points

Neither identifies key assumption nor replicates argument = 0 points

b)   Alternative assumption & alternative conclusion (5 points possible)

Excellent: Offers reasonable alternative assumption, argues to new conclusion, offers suggestions for how to verify validity of alternative assumption = 5 points

Very Good: Offers reasonable alternative assumption, argues to new conclusion, but does not offer suggestions for how to verify validity of alternative assumption = 3-4 points

Passable: Offers reasonable alternative assumption, argues to new conclusion, but leaps or flaws of logic in argument = 1-2 point

Not passable: doesn't get it = 0 points

[4]   Academic Honesty

Any evidence of plagiarism = 0 points for entire assignment